

employees not enter the trench on the day of the collapse. The ALJ findings, and the reasonable inferences drawn from them, easily satisfy the substantial-evidence standard. Consequently, the ALJ's decision affirming the citations is affirmed.

CASE QUESTIONS

1. What was the legal issue in this case? What did the court decide?
2. What exactly did the employer do or fail to do that violated the OSH Act?
3. Why was it "unavailing for Williams to argue that *employees* must take greater care to avoid placing themselves in harm's way"? What role, if any, should employees' actions have in determining liability under the OSH Act?
4. Ultimately, these violations that caused, or at least contributed to, the death of an employee and serious injuries to another resulted in a \$22,000 fine for the employer. Is that a just outcome? Are the penalties for violations of OSHA standards sufficient?